RESOLUTION NO.\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

RE: CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS UNDER THE

PROVISIONS OF THE ACT OF THE PENNSYLVANIA

LEGISLATURE 1961, JUNE 13, P.L. 282 (53

SECTION 8004) AND BETHLEHEM ORDINANCE NO.

3952 AS AMENDED.

WHEREAS, it is proposed to secure a COA for rehabilitation of the existing Eugene Grace mansion and for construction of six new townhouses at 114 West Fourth Street.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Bethlehem that a Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby DENIED for the proposal.

Sponsored by: (s)

(s)

ADOPTED BY COUNCIL THIS DAY OF

(s)

President of Council

ATTEST:

(s)

City Clerk

**HISTORIC CONSERVATION COMMISSION**

CASE #646 -- It is proposed to rehabilitate the existing Eugene Grace mansion and to construct six new townhouses at 114 West Fourth Street.

OWNER/APPLICANT: Wesley & Sarah Jun/Robin Reshetar

The Commission upon motion by Mr. Traupman and seconded by Mr. Evans adopted the proposal that City Council DENY a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work as described herein:

1. The proposal to rehabilitate the existing Eugene Grace mansion and to construct six new townhouses at 114 West Fourth Street was presented by Mr. Robin Reshetar and Mr. Bradford Lare, Esq.
2. It is proposed to rehabilitate the existing Eugene Grace mansion but to demolish the side (west) addition, rear porch and detached garage of the mansion in order to construct six four-story townhouses organized around a common courtyard at the rear of the property.
3. The motion to DENY the proposed work was approved: 6 in favor, 1 opposed; therefore, the proposal to secure a COA for the proposal was DENIED. Those voting in support of denying approval of the current proposal noted it failed to comply with: Secretary of Interior’s Standards (SIS) 1, 2, 5 and 9; Bethlehem Ordinance 1714.03 Purposes of the Historic Conservation District; and South Bethlehem Design Guidelines concerning such issues as preservation of the cohesive ambiance of the Historic Conservation District with compatible, sympathetic, and contemporary construction; matching setbacks (distances to property lines) of adjacent buildings on a streetscape; compatible siting, proportion, scale, form, materials, fenestration, roof configuration, details and finishes. Many HCC members were unable to justify the Applicant’s proposal to demolish the historical rear porch and detached garage (ca. 1910) without further development of the proposed new construction to address such issues as:
   1. identify proposed height(s) of new construction (must be lower than current proposal), including depiction in relation to heights of adjacent properties; include slope of Martel Street in relation to new construction as well as to adjacent properties
   2. include to-scale drawings of all four exterior elevations with relevant dimensions, also depicting adjacent neighboring structures and associated dimensions
   3. identify placement of exterior bins for trash and recycling
   4. indicate shelter/roofs over entries into individual units of new development proposal
   5. revise brick masonry detail at window and door openings; soldier courses only at headers and sills
   6. delineate individual living units (three along Martel Street) rather than current proposal of one long structure
   7. ideal development solution would not require demolition of rear porch and/or detached garage
   8. rehabilitation efforts of existing Eugene Grace mansion to include:
      1. complete window restoration
      2. add storm windows to all window openings
      3. re-build existing stone retaining wall in-kind
      4. provide new exterior steps at corner of Martel and West Fourth Streets
      5. re-point existing brick walls
      6. complete in-fill of voids upon removal of air-conditioning units
      7. remove existing shingle roof and replace with synthetic or real slate, including all copper flashings
      8. re-construct masonry chimneys according to historical photographs
      9. restore exterior columns and bases at exterior front porch
      10. install new rainwater runoff system using half-round gutters and round downpipes
      11. remove all freestanding signage
      12. re-construct all missing and rotted wooden cornices; repair all damaged wooden elements
      13. re-paint all wooden components
      14. re-build existing box gutters in-kind
   9. cooperate with relevant City officials to satisfy financial security (bond/escrow account) in support of rehabilitation of existing Eugene Grace mansion

JBL: jbl



By:

Date of Meeting: April 17, 2018 Title: Historic Officer